

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
Norfolk Division**

CSX TRANSPORTATION, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v.

Civil Action No. 2:18-cv-530-MSD-RJK

**NORFOLK SOUTHERN RAILWAY
COMPANY, *et al.*,**

Defendants.

**NORFOLK AND PORTSMOUTH BELT LINE RAILROAD COMPANY'S
MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO FILE DOCUMENTS UNDER SEAL**

Norfolk and Portsmouth Belt Line Railroad Company (“Belt Line”), by counsel, states as follows in support of its motion to seal: unredacted portions of its Objection to Denial in Part of its Motion in Limine #5 to Exclude Testimony From Plaintiff’s Expert Howard Marvel. The redactions contain certain highly confidential, proprietary, and sensitive business information, the release of which could harm the Belt Line, CSX Transportation, Inc., and/or Norfolk Southern Railway Company.

1. There are three requirements for sealing court filings: (1) public notice with opportunity to object; (2) consideration of less drastic alternatives; and (3) a statement of specific findings in support of a decision to seal and reject alternatives to sealing. *Flexible Benefits Council v. Feldman*, No. 1:08-CV-371, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 93039 (E.D. Va. Nov. 13, 2008) (citing *Ashcraft v. Conoco, Inc.*, 218 F.3d 282, 288 (4th Cir. 2000)). Even when no party challenges a motion to seal, the Court must still ensure the motion is supported by good cause. *Auburn Univ. v. IBM Corp.*, No. 3:0-cv-694-MEF, unpublished, 2010 WL 3927737 (M.D. Ala. Oct. 4, 2010).

2. All three requirements are met here. On October 29, 2019, the Court entered a Stipulated Protective Order, which governs the parties' use of confidential information produced in this case. *See* D.E. 79. Paragraph 2 of the Stipulated Protective Order defines "Protected Material" as material containing information that "must or may be protected from disclosure," including material designated "CONFIDENTIAL" and "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." *Id.* at para. 2.

3. The Belt Line's brief contains highly confidential and sensitive information relating to CSXT's, NS's, and the Belt Line's transportation and shipping practices, business strategies, internal communications, and other highly confidential, proprietary, and sensitive business information that has been marked as either "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY," the release of which would harm the parties.

4. This information thus constitutes "Protected Material" under the Stipulated Protective Order. *See id.*

5. The Stipulated Protective Order requires the Belt Line to file these documents under seal. *See id.* at para. 16.

For the foregoing reasons, the Belt Line requests that the Court enter the proposed order attached as Exhibit 1 to the Belt Line's motion to seal, granting the Belt Line leave to file the unredacted portions of its Objection to Denial in Part of its Motion in Limine #5 to Exclude Testimony From Plaintiff's Expert Howard Marvel, under seal, and directing the Clerk of Court to maintain such exhibits under seal pending further order of the Court.

Dated: January 24, 2023

**NORFOLK AND PORTSMOUTH
BELT LINE RAILROAD COMPANY**

By: /s/ W. Ryan Snow

James L. Chapman, IV, VSB No. 21983
W. Ryan Snow, VSB No. 47423
Alexander R. McDaniel, VSB No. 92398
CRENSHAW, WARE & MARTIN, P.L.C.
150 W. Main Street, Suite 1923
Norfolk, Virginia 23510
Telephone: (757) 623-3000
Facsimile: (757) 623-5735
jchapman@cwm-law.com
wrsnow@cwm-law.com
amcdaniel@cwm-law.com
*Counsel for Norfolk and Portsmouth Belt
Line Railroad Company*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on this 24th day of January 2023, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send a “Notice of Electronic Filing” to all counsel of record who have consented to electronic service.

/s/ W. Ryan Snow
W. Ryan Snow, VSB No. 47423
CRENSHAW, WARE & MARTIN, P.L.C.
150 W. Main Street, Suite 1923
Norfolk, Virginia 23510
Telephone: (757) 623-3000
Facsimile: (757) 623-5735
wrsnow@cwm-law.com
*Counsel for Norfolk and Portsmouth Belt
Line Railroad Company*